Student Loan Considerations for 2015 Medical Graduates and Incoming Housestaff

By Jason DiLorenzo
Founder & Executive Director
• Changes In Student Debt Levels
• Federal Programs Overview / Applicability
• Maximizing PSLF and Employment Certification
• Savings Scenarios and Case Studies
• Proposed Legislative Changes and Potential Impact
• Refinancing: When and why?
• Training Exit Analysis
• Q&A
Changes in Student Debt Levels

Debt levels have quadrupled in the last 20 years
Regulatory Changes

• 2007: Public Service Loan Forgiveness enacted

• 2009: (July 1st): Income-Based Repayment (IBR) effective

• 2012: Pay As You Earn (PAYE)
  • Available to “new borrowers” on or after Oct. 1, 2007

• 2014: Direct Consolidation Process
  • Choose your own servicer and apply for IBR/PAYE with new application

• 2016: President’s Budget Proposal

Public Service Loan Forgiveness and PAYE provide greatest savings opportunity to medical graduates
No Payment, No Problem?

- Payment unmanageable during residency
- Deferment regulation changes necessitate forbearance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Salary:</th>
<th>$48,000</th>
<th>$48,410</th>
<th>$49,862</th>
<th>$51,358</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10-Year Standard Payment:</td>
<td>$2,525</td>
<td>$2,662</td>
<td>$2,808</td>
<td>$2,965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extended Term Payment:</td>
<td>$1,519</td>
<td>$1,603</td>
<td>$1,693</td>
<td>$1,789</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Cost of Forbearance

Total Forbearance Cost = $64,518
### Pay As You Earn

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>1&lt;sup&gt;st&lt;/sup&gt; Year</th>
<th>2&lt;sup&gt;nd&lt;/sup&gt; Year</th>
<th>3&lt;sup&gt;rd&lt;/sup&gt; Year</th>
<th>4&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt; Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Salary:</strong></td>
<td>$ 48,000</td>
<td>$48,410</td>
<td>$49,862</td>
<td>$51,358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>10-Year Standard Payment:</strong></td>
<td>$2,525</td>
<td>$2,662</td>
<td>$2,808</td>
<td>$2,965</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Extended Term Payment:</strong></td>
<td>$1,519</td>
<td>$1,603</td>
<td>$1,693</td>
<td>$1,789</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>PAYE Payment:</strong></td>
<td>$ 0</td>
<td>$ 57</td>
<td>$256</td>
<td>$259</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### PAYE Subsidy Earned

- 1<sup>st</sup> Year: $3,178
- 2<sup>nd</sup> Year: $6,871
- 3<sup>rd</sup> Year: $13,663
- 4<sup>th</sup> Year: $14,819

#### Interest Paid

- 1<sup>st</sup> Year: $1,156
- 2<sup>nd</sup> Year: $1,104
- 3<sup>rd</sup> Year: $918
- 4<sup>th</sup> Year: $3,118

### Interest Paid by Year

- **1<sup>st</sup> Year**
  - Salary: $13,663
  - Subsidy Earned: $3,178
  - Interest Paid: $10,485

- **2<sup>nd</sup> Year**
  - Salary: $13,038
  - Subsidy Earned: $6,871
  - Interest Paid: $6,167

- **3<sup>rd</sup> Year**
  - Salary: $10,824
  - Subsidy Earned: $13,663
  - Interest Paid: $3,800

- **4<sup>th</sup> Year**
  - Salary: $11,701
  - Subsidy Earned: $3,118
  - Interest Paid: $8,583
Public Service Loan Forgiveness

Eligible Loans: Direct Stafford & Grad PLUS
(FFEL, Perkins, HPSL and LDS can be consolidated for eligibility)

Specific requirements:

• Borrower must make 120 qualifying payments on a Federal Direct Loan

• Borrower must work for a public service entity as defined by the program, such as a Federal, State, Local, or non-profit organization
  • Employment Certification Form is available, not mandatory
    • Will trigger transition to FedLoans as servicer

Approximately 80% of hospitals are non-profit
Stark Law Overview and Impact

- Bans the practice of physician self-referral, there are loopholes
- Some states have more restrictive interpretation than others
- Specialties with higher likelihood of for-profit employment after training:
  - Emergency Medicine
  - Anesthesia
  - Radiology
- Paths with higher non-profit opportunity:
  - Family Medicine/Primary Care
  - Pediatrics
  - Academic
  - States where non-profit hospitals more inclined to employ directly

Non-profit “Setting” May Not Qualify as Public Service
Loan Forgiveness – True Cost of Debt

4-Year Residency

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Residency</th>
<th>Standard Repayment</th>
<th>IBR Payment</th>
<th>PAYE Payment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1st</td>
<td>$395,160</td>
<td>$164,590</td>
<td>$109,726</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2nd</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14th</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Standard Repayment
IBR Payment
PAYE Payment
Amount of Savings for a Physician Using Pay As You Earn versus a 10 Year Standard Repayment Term

Amount of Federal Debt

Savings Amount

$175,000

$120,000

$100,000

$80,000

$60,000

$40,000

$20,000

$0

$150,000

$140,000

$160,000

$180,000

$200,000

$220,000

$240,000

Years in Residency

3

4

5

6

7

Post Residency Starting Salary

Savings

$50,000

$0

$150,000

$200,000

$250,000

$300,000

Post Residency Starting Salary
Savings: $28,441 (Present Value)
# Obama 2016 Budget Proposal

## Repayment Under Obama's Proposal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Income Driven Repayment Calculation</th>
<th>Limited to 10% of discretionary income</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cap on payments removed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Loan Forgiveness</th>
<th>10 Years if working in the Public Sector AND loan balance less than $57,500</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>20 years for borrowers with total loan balance less than $57,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25 years for borrowers with total loan balance greater than $57,500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Expansion of PAYE to all federal loan borrowers
- Removal of cap on payments
- New cap on amount forgiven through PSLF
  - $57,500 limit, based on max borrowing amount for independent undergrads
  - Balances above $57,500 will not be forgiven until 20-25 years of participation
- Household income used for documentation instead of MFS
- 20 and 25 year forgiveness options to be tax-free
Other Considerations:

– Consolidation
– Taxes
– Refinancing
**Considerations for Loan Consolidation**

- **Do I need to consolidate?**
  - PSLF and PAYE are available for Direct Loans only
  - IBR available for FFEL loans but not PSLF eligible
  - Perkins, HPSL, LDS (some don’t appear on NSLDS!)

- **Option to choose servicer**
  - FedLoans is PSLF servicer
  - Varying turnaround times for processing applications
  - Varied standards for income verification (best to file tax return)
  - Service considerations

- **Servicer Errors**
  - Eligible loans not included in consolidation
  - Wrong repayment plan implemented
  - Incorrect advice regarding consolidation for forbearance, IBR/PAYE/PSLF

*You have 10 business days to make changes once Loan Summary Sheet is issued*
**Tying the Knot: A Case Study**

A PGY2 resident with $207k in federal student loan debt on academic career track gets married. How does the loan repayment strategy change if the spouse has no student loan debt and makes $90K salary?

![Graph showing loan repayment strategy](image)

**Forgiveness Potential**
- **$232,039 (Filing Joint)**
- **$150,305 (Filing Separate)**
A Physician’s Fork in the Road

Forgiveness  Refinancing
To Re or Not to Re: That is the Question

Opportunity:

• Lending marketplace increasingly crowded and highly competitive
• Transaction-focused, not consultative
• Rates can be competitive, fixed as low as 3.5%
• Available in training for some Housestaff
• For graduates with $75k or less in federal debt, PSLF likely holds little value, refinancing may make sense

Considerations:

• Loss of subsidy/forgiveness benefits on Federal education loans
• Liquidity, as forbearance and deferment typically not allowed after refinancing
• Origination and other fees may erode savings
• Fixed vs. variable rate loan types have significant impact on long-term vs. short-term savings
• Your time horizon for paying off the particular debt
Recommended Refinancing Process

1. Identify if refinancing is suitable!

2. Review existing financial and credit profile to determine if refinancing is available
   - Debt-to-income ratio considered
   - No negative credit history, min 680 score
   - Adding co-signer can improve results

3. Approach marketplace

4. Once terms and rates are quoted, select option in the context of your liquidity needs
   - Work with an Advisor
   - Deferment/Low payments in residency available
   - Better rates available for shorter terms, but can you afford higher payment right after training?
**Refinancing Considerations**

- Reduced or no payments in-residency may be available
- No prepayment penalties or origination fees
- Discharge in death or permanent disability
- May not be protected in bankruptcy
- NHSC/NIH eligible

### Amount Refinanced:

$198,479

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>5 Year</th>
<th>10 Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interest Rate</td>
<td>4.125%</td>
<td>5.000%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### In-Training

| Payment in Training      | $100  | $100   |
| Unpaid Interest after training | $10,481 | $13,086 |
| Regular Payment          | $3,860 | $2,244 |
| Total Paid               | $233,394 | $271,068 |
| Total Interest Paid      | $34,928 | $72,598 |
| # of Months to Pay Off   | 78     | 138    |

#### Regular

| Regular Payment          | $3,666 | $2,105 |
| Total Paid               | $219,977 | $252,613 |
| Total Interest Paid      | $21,511  | $54,142 |
| # of Months to Pay Off   | 60     | 120    |
Training Exit Strategy
After 4 years of training, a graduating resident contemplates the next step in her career. How does loan forgiveness impact the economics of working for a non-profit?

Original Debt: $250,000
Debt after training: $308,000
Non-profit salary offer: $155,000
For-profit salary offer: $205,000
 Costs and Benefits of Career Opportunities

PV of Earnings in Years 5 - 10

- PSLF: $645,702.11
- For-Profit (Standard 10 Year Payoff Amount): $853,993.11

PV Total Spent

- PSLF: $(77,175.54)
- For-Profit (Standard 10 Year Payoff Amount): $(435,303.98)
Assumptions: PAYE eligible. The taxable equivalent amount assumes a marginal federal tax rate of 20% and a marginal state tax rate of 5%.
After six years of training, a fellow who used PAYE during all of training is contemplating two offers, one with a non-profit organization and the other with a for-profit:

Original Debt: $250,000
Debt after training: $338,000
Non-profit salary offer: $250,000
For-profit salary offer: $325,000

Requirements for PSLF eligibility: At least four more years with PSLF-eligible employer, $93,000 in payments in PAYE based on individual salary

Payments on 10-year standard play after using PAYE during training: $476,000
- Could refinance to reduce cost, subject to marketplace availability
**Sample Analytics**

- **Public Sector Starting Salary**
  - Base Salary: $250,000
  - Additional from Public Service derived from forgiveness: $144,262 ($250,000 + $144,262 = $394,262 total)

- **Private Sector Starting Salary**
  - Actual For-Profit Practice Salary: $325,000
Residency Action Plan

- **Tax Filing:** File a $0 tax return before graduation. Incorporate impact of taxes on federal loan subsidy programs when filing future returns.

- **Consolidation:** Evaluate and complete a consolidation with the Direct Loan Program. Remember to triple-check that all appropriate loans are included.

- **Pay As You Earn:** Apply for and enter PAYE during consolidation process, or three months before end of grace period. Re-apply annually with income documentation and family-size verification.

- **Public Service Loan Forgiveness:** Track eligible payments, maintain employment documentation, and stay up-to-date on changes.

- **Recalibrate Strategy Based on Sector/Salary**

- **Evaluate Refinancing Opportunities**

- **Review Annually**
Wishing You The Best With Your Career in Medicine...

Jason DiLorenzo
Jason@dwoq.com
Physician Starting Salaries by Specialty

- Anesthesia: $276k
- Emergency Medicine: $231k
- Family Medicine: $161k
- IM, General: $180k
- OBGYN: $220k
- Pediatrics: $160k
- Psychiatry: $179k
- Surgery, General: $275k
- Surgery, Neuro: $520k

Higher Salaries Reduce Forgiveness Benefit
Questions from Housestaff

• If I’m in IBR, is it possible that some or all of my federal loans could not be PSLF eligible?

• Is it better to choose a deferment if I’m eligible for one?

• What happens to our loan debt if we die?

• Could you address Obama’s 2016 budget changes and how, if implemented, they would affect those of us who are already submitting paperwork for loan forgiveness (e.g. is there a possibility that we would be grandfathered in through the original program)?